# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURTERKS OF FICE FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

7005 FEB - 4 P 12- 10
U.S. DISTRICT COURI DISTRICT OF MASS.
MDL NO. 1456 C.A. NO. 01-12257-PBS
JUDGE PATTI B. SARIS

# STIPULATION OF JOINDER OF OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL JIM PETRO IN OPPOSITION TO CLASS CERTIFICATION

Jim Petro, Attorney General Michael R. Barrett

OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL
STATE OF OHIO
BARRETT & WEBER, L.P.A.
500 Fourth & Walnut Centre

State Office Tower 105 East Fourth Street 30 East Broad Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor Cincinnati, OH 45202

Columbus, OH 43215-3428 Phone: (513) 721-2120 Phone: (614) 466-4320 Facsimile: (513) 721-2139

Facsimile: (614) 466-5087

Stanley M. Chesley

Fay E. Stilz

FLANAGAN, LIEBERMAN, HOFFMAN

Robert Heuck II & SWAIM
WAITE, SCHNEIDER, BAYLESS, & CHESLEY CO., L.P.A. Dayton, OH 45402

1513 Fourth & Vine Tower Phone: (937) 223-5200
One West Fourth Street Facsimile: (937) 223-3335

Cincinnati, OH 45202 Facsimile: (937) 223-3335

Phone:

(513) 621-0267

Facsimile: (513) 381-2375 (Additional counsel listed on signature block)

Ohio Attorney General Jim Petro joins the opposition to class certification filed by

Pennsylvania Attorney General Thomas Corbett. Mr. Petro has filed two cases in state court in

Ohio against Dey, Inc., Warrick Pharmaceuticals Corp., Schering-Plough Corp., Schering Corp.,

Abbott Laboratories, Inc., Pharmacia Corp., Roxane Laboratories, Inc., Boehringer Ingelheim

Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Ben Venue Laboratories, Inc. and Boehringer Ingelheim Corp. The two

cases are in the process of being consolidated into a single action in the Court of Common Pleas

of Hamilton County, Ohio.

Ohio Attorney General Petro has asserted claims on behalf of the State of Ohio to recover

amounts overcharged by Defendants through their manipulation of average wholesale price and

wholesale acquisition cost data. In addition, Mr. Petro has asserted claims on behalf of all Ohio

Medicare recipients overcharged by Defendants' pricing scheme under Ohio's Consumer Sales

Practices Act R.C. 1345.07(B). For the reasons set forth in the memorandum filed by

Pennsylvania Attorney General Thomas Corbett, Ohio Attorney General Jim Petro opposes

certification of a class that would include the Ohio Medicare beneficiary claims asserted in the

Ohio cases.

Respectfully submitted,

JIM PETRO

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO

Stanley M. Chesley

Fay E. Stilz

Robert Heuck II

WAITE, SCHNEIDER, BAYLESS,

& CHESLEY CO., L.P.A.

1513 Fourth & Vine Tower

One West Fourth Street

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Phone:

(513) 621-0267

Facsimile:

(513) 381-2375

1

Michael R. Barrett BARRETT & WEBER, L.P.A. 500 Fourth & Walnut Centre 105 East Fourth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

Phone: (513) 721-2120 Facsimile: (513) 721-2139

James E. Swaim
FLANAGAN, LIEBERMAN, HOFFMAN
& SWAIM
318 West Fourth Street
Dayton, OH 45402
Phone: (937) 223-5200

Phone: (937) 223-5200 Facsimile: (937) 223-3335

#### Of Counsel:

C. David Ewing
GARDNER, EWING AND SOUZA
1600 Meidinger Tower
462 South Fourth Avenue
Louisville, KY 40202

Phone: (502) 585-5800 Facsimile: (502) 585-5858

W.B. Markovits
MARKOVITS & GREIWE CO., L.P.A.
119 East Court Street, Suite 500
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Phone: (513) 977-4774 Facsimile: (513) 621-7086

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

Served this 21 day of February, 2005, by First Class U.S. Mail on the counsel listed below.

## **PLAINTIFFS:**

Attorney General, State of Connecticut 55 Elm Street, P.O. Box 120 Hartford, CT 06141 Phone: (860) 808-5355

Bolognese & Associates, LLC One Penn Center

650

Philadelphia, PA 19103

State of Connecticut

Phone: (215) 814-6750

United Food and Commercial Unions and Employers Midwest Health Benefits Fund and Action Alliance of Senior Citizens of Greater Philadelphia

Heins Mills & Olson, P.L.C.

700 Northstar East

608 Second Avenue South

Minneapolis, MN 55402

Phone: (612) 338-4605 Facsimile: (612) 338-4692

AWP

Hoffman & Edelson, LLC 45 West Court Street Doylestown, PA 18901

Phone: (215) 230-8043

Action Alliance of Senior Citizens of Greater Philadelphia

Hulett Harper LLP 550 West C Street Suite 1770 San Diego, CA 92101

Phone: (619) 338-1133

Dey Sicor Gensia

Keller Rohrback, L.L.P. 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200 Seattle, WA 98101

Phone: (206) 623-1900

Action Alliance of Senior Citizens of Greater Philadelphia

Kirby, McInerney & Squire, LLP 830 Third Avenue, 10th Floor New York, NY 10022 Phone: (212) 317-2300 Suffolk County

Moscone, Emblidge & Quadra, LLP 180 Montgomery Street, Suite 1240 San Francisco, CA 94104 Phone: (415) 362-3599 Constance Thompson & John Rice

Murray & Howard, LLP 436 14th Street, Suite 1413 Oakland, CA 94102

Phone: (510) 444-2660

Turner v. Abbott

Piper & Associates 624 Pierre Avenue Shreveport, LA 71103 Phone: (318) 226-0826 Maggie Hudson & Mary Helen Robinson

Roda & Nast, P.C. 801 Estelle Drive Lancaster, PA 17552 Phone: (717) 892-3000

Action Alliance of Senior Citizens of Greater Philadelphia

Rossbacher & Assoc. 811 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1650 Los Angeles, CA 90017 Phone: (213) 895-6500 Dr. Shirley Geller Shepherd, Finkelman, Miller & Shah, LLC

35 East State Street Media, PA 19063

Phone: (610) 891-9880

Board of Trustees of Carpenters and Millwrights of

Spector, Roseman & Kodroff, P.C.

1818 Market Street, Suite 2500

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone: (215) 496-0300

Teamsters Health & Welfare Fund: Of Philadelphia and Vicinity

Squitieri & Fearon, LLP

521 Fifth Avenue, 26th Floor

New York, NY 10175

Phone: (646) 487-3049

Twin Cities Bakeries Fund

Stern Shapiro Weissberg & Garin

90 Canal Street

Boston, MA 02114

Phone: (617) 742-5800

Ven-A-Care of The Florida Keys, Inc.

Trujillo Rodriguez & Richards, LLC

3 Kings Highway East

Haddonfield, NJ 08033

Phone: (856) 795-9002

Action Alliance of Senior Citizens of Greater Philadelphia; Twin Cities Bakery Workers Health and Welfare Fund; United Food and Commercial Workers Unions and Employers Midwest Health Benefits Fund

Weller, Green, Toups & Terrell, L.L.P.

2615 Calder, Suite 400

P.O. Box 350

Beaumont, TX 77704

Phone: (409) 838-0101

Board of Trustees of the Carpenters and Millwrights of Houston & Vicinity Welfare Trust Fund

#### **DEFENDANTS:**

Arent Fox Kintner Plotkin & Kahn PLLC 1050 Connecticut Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036 Phone: (202) 857-6000 Chiron Corporation

Arnold & Porter/Endo
555 12th Street NW
Washington, DC 20004
Phone: (202) 942-5000
Endo Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll, LLP 1735 Market Street, 51st Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 Phone: (215) 665-8500 *Immunex Corp.* 

Baxter Healthcare Corp.
One Baxter Parkway
Deerfield, IL 60015
Phone: (847) 948-4971
Baxter Healthcare Corp.

Bingham McCutchen, LLP 150 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110 Phone: (617) 951-8000

Fujisawa Healthcare, Inc.; Takeda Chemical Industries Ltd.; Together Rx LLC

Chiron Corporation
4560 Horton Street
MS/R-422
Emeryville, CA 94608-291
Phone: (510) 923-3974
Chiron Corporation

Coudert Brothers 1114 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036 Phone: (212) 626-4400 Dey, Inc. Covington and Burling 1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20004

Phone: (202) 662-6000

GlaxoSmithKline

Davis Polk and Wardwell 450 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10017

Phone: (212) 450-4000 AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals, L.P.

Dechert Price & Rhoads 1717 Arch Street Bell Atlantic Tower Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone: (215) 994-2489

GlaxoSmithKline

Dickstein Shapiro Morin & Oshinsky LLP

2101 L Street, NW

Washington, DC 20037

Phone: (202) 785-9700

Baxter International, Inc.; Baxter Healthcare Corp.; Baxter Pharmaceutical Products, Inc.

DKW LAW GROUP, PC 58TH Floor, U.S. Steel Tower 600 Grant Street

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Phone: (412) 355-2973

Mylan Laboratories, Inc.

Donnelly, Conroy & Gelhaar, LLP

One Beacon St., 33rd Floor

Boston, MA 02108

Phone: (617) 720-2880

Baxter International, Inc.; Baxter Healthcare Corp.; Baxter Pharmaceutical Products, Inc.

Dornbush Mensch Mandelstam & Schaeffer, LLP

747 Third Avenue

New York, NY 10017

Phone: (212) 759-3300

Forest

Dwyer & Collora, LLP Federal Reserve Plaza 600 Atlantic Avenue Boston, MA 02210

Phone: (617) 371-1000 Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.

Foley Hoag LLP 155 Seaport Boulevard Boston, MA 02210

Phone: (617) 832-1000 AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals, L.P.

Gibbons, Del Deo, Dolan, Griffinger & Vecchione, P.C. One Riverfront Plaza
Newark, NJ 07102
Planta (073) 506 4753

Phone: (973) 596-4753 Berlex Laboratories, Inc.

Goulston & Storrs 400 Atlantic Avenue Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 482-1776

Immunex Corp.

Greenberg Traurig, LLP One International Place Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 310-6000

Mylan Laboratories, Inc.

Hogan & Hartson L.L.P. 555 Thirteenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20004

Phone: (202) 637-6853

Amgen Inc.: Aventis; Behring; Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.; Oncology Therapeutics Network

Corp.; Holland & Knight GlaxoSmithKline

Hughes Hubbard & Reed 1775 I Street N.W. Washington, DC 20006

Phone: (202) 721-4600

Merck & Co., Inc.

Hyman, Phelps & McNamara, P.C. 700 13th Street, N.W., Suite 1200 Washington, DC 20005 Phone: (202) 737-9624 Watson Pharma, Inc.

Irell & Manella LLP 1800 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 900 Los Angeles, CA 90067 Phone: (310) 277-1010 IVAX Corp.

Jenner & Block, LLC 330 North Wabash One IBM Plaza Chicago, IL 60611 Phone: (312) 222-9350 Takeda Chemical Industries, Ltd.

Jones Day
77 West Wacker Dr Suite 3500
Chicago, IL 60601
Phone: (312) 782-3939
Abbott Laboratories and Abbott Laboratories, Inc.

Kelley Drye & Warren LLP 101 Park Avenue New York, NY 10178 Phone: (212) 808-7800 Dey, Inc.

Kelly, Libby & Hoopes, P.C. 175 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110 Phone: (617) 338-9300 Amgen Inc.

King & Spalding, LLP 1730 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20016 Phone: (202) 737-0500 Hofmann-La Roche Inc. Kirkland & Ellis LLP 655 Fifteenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20005

Phone: (202) 879-5000

B. Braun Medical Inc.

Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP 75 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
Phone: (617) 261, 3100

Phone: (617) 261-3100 Aventis Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Knapp, Petersen & Clarke 500 North Brand Boulevard 20th Floor Glendale, CA 91203 Phone: (818) 547-5000 Alpha Therapeutic Corp.

Laredo & Smith, LLP 15 Broad Street, Suite 600 Boston, MA 02109

Phone: (617) 367-7984

Pharmacia Corporation; Pharmacia & Upjohn, Inc; and Monsanto Company

Law Office of Robert A. Griffith 67 Batterymarch Street, Suite 400 Boston, MA 02110 Phone: (617) 338-7277

Watson Pharma, Inc.

Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris, Glovsky and Popeo, P.C. 701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Suite 900 Washington, DC 20004 Phone: (202) 434-7300 Eli Lilly and Company

Morgan Lewis and Bockius 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103 Phone: (215) 963-5000

Pharmacia Corporation

Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP 300 South Grand Avenue **Suite 2200** Los Angeles, CA 90071

Phone: (213) 612-2500

Pharmacia Corporation; Pharmacia & Upjohn, Inc; and Monsanto Company

Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103 Phone: (215) 963-5322

Morrison & Foerster - AWP 5200 Republic Plaza 370 Seventeenth Street Denver, CO 80202

Pfizer, Inc. (Pharmacia)

Phone: (303) 592-1500

Purdue Pharma L.P.

Nixon Peabody LLP 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110 Phone: (617) 345-1000 Alpha Therapeutic Corp.

Nixon Peabody LLP 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110 Phone: (617) 951-6600 Bayer Corp.; Allergan, Inc.

Nutter, McClennen & Fish, LLP World Trade Center West 155 Seaport Boulevard Boston, MA 02210 Nahi Biopharmaceuticals

Ober, Kaler, Grimes & Shriver 120 East Baltimore Street Baltimore, MD 21202 Phone: (410) 685-1120 American Home Products (Wyeth) Patterson, Belknap, Webb & Tyler LLP

1133 Avenue of the Americas

New York, NY 10036

Phone: (212) 336-2000

Johnson & Johnson; Centocor, Inc.; Ethicon Endo-Surgery, Inc.; ALZA Corp.

Peabody & Arnold, LLP

30 Rowes Warf

Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 951-2100

Hoffmann-La Roche, Inc.

Perkins Coie

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4800

Seattle, WA 98101

Phone: (206) 583-8888

Immunex Corp.

Pillsbury Winthrop LLP

2550 Hanover Street

Palo Alto, CA 94304

Phone: (650) 233-4500

SICOR Inc.; Gensia SICOR Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Piper Rudnick LLP

One International Place

21st Floor

Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 406-6000

SICOR Inc.; Gensia SICOR Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Reed Smith, LLP

1301 K Street, N.W.

Suite 1100 East Tower

Washington, DC 20005

Phone: (202) 414-9200

Faulding Pharmaceuticals; Fujisawa Healthcare, Inc.

Ropes and Gray

One International Place

Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 951-7000

Schering-Plough Corporation; Warrick Pharmaceuticals

Sherin and Lodgen LLP 100 Summer Street Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 646-2000

Sicor, Inc.

Shook, Hardy & Bacon LLP 2555 Grand. Boulevard Kansas City, MO 64108 Phone: (816) 474-6550 Aventis Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Sidley Austin Brown & Wood 10 S. Dearborn Street Chicago, IL 60603 Phone: (312) 853-7000

Bayer Corp.; Allergan, Inc.

Testa, Hurwitz and Thibeault, LLP 125 High Street Boston, MA 02110

Phone: (617) 248-7000

Abbott Laboratories and Abbott Laboratories, Inc.

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216 Phone: (614) 464-6400 Bedford Laboratories

White & Case LLP 1155 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036 (212) 819-8200 Phone: Geneva Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Williams & Connolly LLP 725 12th Street, NW Washington, DC 20005 Phone: (202) 434-5526

Medimmune, Inc.

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP 60 State Street Boston, MA 02109 Phone: (617) 526-6000

American Home Products (Wyeth)

Jumi !